Multiple Perspectives

Essential Questions

- How can an examination of texts through multiple perspectives affect understanding?
- How do media production elements shape a message?

Unit Overview

In Units 1 through 3, you explored the concept “Perception Is Everything” by learning to apply various critical perspectives to the texts you encountered. Unit 4 expands this understanding by guiding you to apply all of the critical perspectives to a single text; first, you and your class will read and interpret *The Arrival* by Shaun Tan, applying Reader Response, Historical, Feminist, Marxist, and Archetypal Criticism at different points during your study, just as you have practiced in previous units. At the same time, however, you will begin engaging in an ongoing process to help you keep track of how Cultural Criticism enhances your understanding of the entire graphic novel, *The Arrival*. This work will prepare you to explore a novel or play with a small group, choosing which critical perspectives to apply and evaluating how each one helped you make meaning. By the end of the unit, you and your small group should be well prepared to demonstrate how multiple critical perspectives enriched your understanding of the novel or play you chose.
Unit 4

Multiple Perspectives

Contents

Learning Focus: New Literacies ................................................. 227

Activities:

4.1 Previewing the Unit .................................................. 228
4.2 Understanding the Genre ........................................... 229
4.3 Beginning the Graphic Novel ................................. 230
  *Graphic Novel: The Arrival, by Shaun Tan
4.4 Framing the Narrative ............................................... 234
4.5 Transitioning to a New Land ..................................... 237
  Nonfiction: Excerpt from Making Comics, by Scott McCloud
4.6 Angles and Perspectives ............................................ 243
4.7 Marginalized Peoples ................................................. 245
4.8 Choosing a Perspective .............................................. 246
4.9 Adapting for an Audience ......................................... 247
  Song: Lyrics from “The Immigrant Song,” by Led Zeppelin
  Poetry: “The New Colossus,” by Emma Lazarus
4.10 Designing a Media Communication ......................... 251
4.11 The Author’s Perspective ......................................... 252
  Essay: Excerpt from “Comments on The Arrival,” by Shaun Tan
4.12 Multiple Perspectives on the Graphic Novel ............. 255
4.13 Independent Reading and Discussion ....................... 257
  *Novels or plays of literary merit
4.14 Exploring Critical Perspectives ............................... 259
  *Novels or plays of literary merit
4.15 Assessing Perspectives ............................................. 260
  *Novels or plays of literary merit

Embedded Assessment Presenting a Literary Work Through
Multiple Critical Perspectives .............................................. 261

Unit Reflection ................................................................. 264

*Texts not included in these materials.

Goals

- To trace a reading through a critical perspective over the course of an extended text
- To analyze two literary works through multiple critical perspectives
- To analyze and then utilize text features of a graphic novel
- To create a presentation using a performance-based or visual medium

Academic Vocabulary

Archetypal Criticism
Cultural Criticism
Feminist Criticism
Historical Criticism
Marxist Criticism
Reader Response Criticism

SpringBoard® English Textual Power™ Senior English
Learning Focus:

New Literacies

*New literacies* is a term used to denote new types of reading demands that may require new and different skills in the twenty-first century.

If you do research online, connect with friends via an online social networking site, share photos over the Internet, contribute to blogs, or access your homework assignments via webmail, you are using new literacy skills that put you squarely in the forefront of the burgeoning possibilities afforded by new media channels in our daily lives. Even as you create new texts with these new media channels, you are expected to analyze and critically evaluate these new forms of communication also. Your critical evaluation helps you choose how you will communicate and with whom.

Increasingly you must be able to collaborate with others to create an original media communication for a variety of purposes. Your ability to understand your purpose, analyze your audience, and select appropriate production elements is the basis of successful media communications.

The elements that make up a successful media product include composition, sound (both diegetic and non-diegetic), transitions between shots, color, lighting, and framing choices. All of these elements are chosen to suit the purpose and audience.

One form of media product that has begun to emerge as a form of new literacy is the graphic novel. Graphic novels are an emerging genre of media text that should command our respect, and they raise the question of what defines “literary merit.” Which books and plays get to be called “Great Literature,” and who creates that list? How has the literary canon, the collection of literature held in highest regard, changed over time, and why? You may know that some books that are now considered classics, such as Zora Neale Hurston’s *Their Eyes Were Watching God*, are actually recent additions to the canon of American literature. The collection of literary works honored by a society does evolve, and the explosion of new kinds of literacies in today’s world keeps these questions relevant. Your study and assessment of this new literacy form gives you a voice in the community of readers who assign value to texts.

**Independent Reading:** In this unit, you will read a graphic novel about the experiences of a man who emigrates to a new country. For your own reading, you might consider short stories or essays on immigrant experiences.
Essential Questions

1. How can an examination of text through multiple perspectives affect understanding?

2. How do media production elements shape a message?

Unit Overview and Learning Focus
Predict what you think this unit is about. Use the words or phrases that stood out to you when you read the Unit Overview and the Learning Focus.

Embedded Assessment 1
What knowledge must you have (what do you need to know) to succeed on Embedded Assessment 1? What skills must you have (what must you be able to do)?
One of the major texts in this unit is a graphic novel. It is important, then, to clarify your understanding of the graphic novel as a genre.

**What is a graphic novel?** Write your initial ideas as well as those of your classmates.

**What questions do you have about graphic novels?** Write down any questions generated by you and your classmates.

**How are comics different from graphic novels?** Here are two formal definitions. Consider the basic differences.

- **Comics** are “juxtaposed pictorial and other images in deliberate sequence, intended to convey information and/or to produce an aesthetic response in the viewer.” (Scott McCloud)

- **A graphic novel** is a “book-length sequential art narrative featuring an anthology-style collection of comic art, a collection of reprinted comic book issues comprising a single story line (or arc), or an original, stand-alone graphic narrative.” (James Bucky Carter)

**Quickwrite:** After exploring the genre, compose a quickwrite on these questions: To what extent are visual and graphic media a significant factor in your life now, and how do you interact with them? How might knowledge of visual and graphic media be a twenty-first century skill?
ABOUT THE AUTHOR
Shaun Tan was born in 1974 near Perth, Australia. He attended the University of Western Australia, graduating in 1995 with honors in English Literature and Fine Arts. He began drawing and illustrating for small-press magazines and has since become known for his illustrated books. He has also worked as a concept artist for the films *Horton Hears a Who* and *WALL-E*. He has received numerous awards including the 2007 World Fantasy Award for Best Artist and the Children’s Book Council of Australia Picture Book of the Year Award for two of his books—*The Arrival* and *The Red Tree*.

Previewing the Text
You will be reading Shaun Tan’s graphic novel, *The Arrival*. Previewing a text can facilitate your understanding. To preview this novel, scan the following and then predict what you think the novel will be about:

- The front and back covers
- The inside covers
- The title and copyright page

After you make your prediction, continue with the following steps:

- Scan the text to determine the structure of the book.
- Analyze and describe the style of the author.

Preparing a Book Summary
The Embedded Assessment asks you to summarize a book. After reading Part I, practice writing a succinct, yet complete, summary of the plot of Part I.

LITERARY TERMS
The structure of a literary work is the way it is organized, the arrangement of its parts.

Style refers to the way writers say what they want to say.

The plot is the series of events that make up a story, novel, or play.
Applying Cultural Criticism

One of the critical perspectives you might apply to *The Arrival* is Cultural Criticism. Reread the definition of this perspective and its assumptions in Appendix 1.

Now brainstorm a list of elements of culture:

What are some elements of culture that you noticed in Part I?
### Taking Notes on Discussion

As your group discusses the questions you generated about Part I of *The Arrival*, take notes on the graphic organizer. Write ideas shared by members of the group, including you, and summarize the support provided. Record your own responses, even if you do not share them with the group, and/or interesting responses from the group.

### Discussion Notes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>An Interesting Point Made By a Member of the Discussion Group</th>
<th>Support</th>
<th>Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Applying Reader Response Criticism

Another way to examine the text is to consider the Reader Response Critical Perspective, which you studied in Unit 1. This graphic organizer, which you also saw in Unit 1, can help you organize your thoughts about Part 1 of *The Arrival* as seen from this perspective.

**Writing Prompt:** Draft a response to Part 1 of *The Arrival*, considering and including the following ideas in your response:

- Whether the cultural elements in Part 1 are familiar or unfamiliar, based on what you bring to the text.
- How the reading situation, such as sharing a book and reading in the classroom, influenced your understanding of the text.
- How the graphic novel genre influences your understanding and appreciation of *The Arrival*.

**Reviewing Part I**

What title could you give to Part I that would capture the essence of the text? How does Shaun Tan’s *The Arrival* match up with your notes about graphic novels?
The author/illustrator of a graphic novel makes deliberate choices about framing (how close or far away the subject of the picture seems to be) and about the size of each panel on a page.

1. Sketch stick figures to illustrate these framing options:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Close-up</th>
<th>Medium Shot</th>
<th>Long Shot</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

2. On separate paper, create a graphic organizer such as a T-chart to take notes on the framing choices Tan makes and the effects of the choices.

3. Add to these notes as your teacher leads a guided reading of the first few pages of Part II. Notice the composition, variety in the number of panels on a page, and the framing used in each. Consider these questions as you read the material:
   - How does Tan vary the number of panels on the page?
   - Why might an author vary the size of the panels in this way?
   - How would you describe the people on the ship?
   - What might the folded paper bird indicate?
   - What might the flock of birds indicate?
   - What might the people on the ship be thinking when they see the two giant statues shaking hands in the harbor?
   - What do you know about practices at points of entry for immigrants to the United States?
4. The protagonist makes a bird from paper, which may remind you of a paper bird you saw in Part I. Reread those illustrations with the understanding that the paper bird is a motif that will appear again and again in the book. What role has it played so far? Try to predict future uses of this image.

5. As you continue reading Part II, continue to pay attention to framing and effects.
   - How many panels are on a page?
   - Are the panels close-up, medium shots, or long shots?
   - Which panels seem the most interesting? Why?

6. Reread the pages that show the protagonist’s experiences as he enters the new land.
   - Consider how his experiences align with your prior knowledge about the processes for entering a new country.
   - Examine the protagonist’s experiences through a Historical Critical Perspective.

WORD CONNECTIONS

The word *protagonist* is made from the Greek prefix *proto-*, meaning “first,” and the Greek word *agōnistēs*, meaning “actor.” Other words using the prefix *proto-* include *prototype*, *proton*, and *protozoan*.
7. Use this graphic organizer to examine how Cultural Criticism can help you make meaning from the portion of *The Arrival*, Part II, that you just read. If you notice additional elements of culture, feel free to add them to the list.

### Tracing a Critical Perspective

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title of Text</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Genre</th>
<th>Critical Perspective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Definition in your own words:</td>
<td></td>
<td>Common assumptions:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location in the text</td>
<td>Element of Culture</td>
<td>Is this element of culture familiar, alien, or in between to the protagonist? How does the author capture the response?</td>
<td>What do you think is the significance of this element of culture?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Scott McCloud has created an illustrated explanation of the six techniques used to create transitions in comics and graphic novels. As you read and consider his explanation, which begins on the next page, complete the graphic organizer below. Because *The Arrival* does not contain the sixth technique, *non sequitur*, it has been omitted from this chart.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Transition Technique</th>
<th>Example from <em>The Arrival</em></th>
<th>Effect of Transition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Moment to moment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Action to action</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject to subject</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scene to scene</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aspect to aspect</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Transitioning to a New Land

Nonfiction

From Making Comics

by Scott McCloud

1. MOMENT TO MOMENT
   A single action portrayed in a series of moments.

2. ACTION TO ACTION
   A single subject (person, object, etc...) in a series of actions.

3. SUBJECT TO SUBJECT
   A series of changing subjects within a single scene.

4. SCENE TO SCENE
   Transitions across significant distances of time and/or space.

5. ASPECT TO ASPECT
   Transitions from one aspect of a place, idea or mood to another.

6. NON SEQUITUR
   A series of seemingly nonsensical, unrelated images and/or words.
MOMENT TO MOMENT TRANSITIONS, FOR EXAMPLE, ARE USEFUL FOR SLOWING THE ACTION DOWN, INCREASING SUSPENSE, CATCHING SMALL CHANGES AND CREATING MOVIE-LIKE MOTION ON THE PAGE.

ACTION TO ACTION TRANSITIONS ARE KNOWN FOR THEIR EFFICIENCY. THE CARTOONIST ONLY PICKS ONE MOMENT PER ACTION, SO EACH PANEL HELPS FURTHER THE PLOT AND KEEP THE PACE BRISK.

SUBJECT TO SUBJECT TRANSITIONS ARE EQUALLY EFFICIENT AT MOVING THE STORY FORWARD -- -- WHILE CHANGING ANGLES TO DIRECT READER ATTENTION AS NEEDED.*

DON'T YOU LOVE ME ANYMORE, KAREN? OK, BOB?

YOU'RE JUST SO EASILY DISTRACTED.

YOU'RE NOT AND I CAN PROVE IT.

YOU SEE THAT CLOCK ON THE WALL?

YOU HAVEN'T HAD NACHOS.

HM... WELL? WHAT ABOUT IT?

BOB!!
SCENE TO SCENE JUMPS CAN HELP COMPRESS A STORY DOWN TO A MANAGEABLE LENGTH, WHILE STILL ALLOWING FOR A RANGE OF TIME-SPANS AND A BREADTH OF LOCATIONS. LOOK HARD AT YOUR STORIES AND YOU MAY FIND YOU CAN CUT A LOT OUT.

ONE YEAR LATER...

MEANWHILE, IN PARIS...

SOMETIMES IT MAY SUIT YOUR NARRATIVE TO HAVE TIME STAND STILL AND LET THE EYE WANDER.

ASPECT TO ASPECT TRANSITIONS DO JUST THAT, AND THEY’VE BEEN USED SUCCESSFULLY IN JAPAN -- AND RECENTLY, IN NORTH AMERICA -- TO CREATE A STRONG SENSE OF PLACE AND MOOD.

AND FINALLY THE NON SEQUITUR. WHICH, THOUGH IT MAY NOT DO ANYTHING TO ADVANCE A STORY --

-- HAS PLAYED A ROLE IN EXPERIMENTAL COMICS, PROVIDING THE OCCASIONAL NONSENSE GAG IN OTHERWISE RATIONAL STORIES.
Reading and Analyzing Part II, *The Arrival*

**Looking at Sensory Images:** You have identified sensory images in poetry and other genres, but you might not have realized that illustrations can appeal to the senses, too. Read the sequence of seven frames that follow the moment when the protagonist leaves the transportation device and make a list of Tan's illustrations that appeal to the various senses.

**Using a Critical Perspective:** In the previous activity, you started taking notes about the cultural elements that appear in *The Arrival* on a graphic organizer called “Tracing a Critical Perspective” (page 236). Add to those notes, and then use them as you draft an interior monologue from the protagonist’s point of view, describing what you see upon arriving in this new setting.

**Summarizing Events:** Examine the sequence of illustrations that show the protagonist finding a place to stay, and summarize how he manages to do it. Include the obstacles he encounters and how he overcomes them, and remember to make your summary succinct yet complete.
**Activity 4.5**

**Transitioning to a New Land**

**Literary Terms**

**Mood** is the atmosphere or general feeling in a literary work.

**Considering Mood:** After you finish reading Part II, identify the mood at the end. What details in the text create this mood?

**Analyzing Establishing Shots:** Meet with a discussion group to analyze the establishing shots Tan has used so far. Take notes during the discussion, either copying the notetaking graphic organizer used in Activity 4.3 or devising one of your own.

**Creating a Title:** Consider what you have learned about Part II, and create an original title that clearly represents the events and their meaning.
Reading and Analyzing Part III, *The Arrival*

The beginning of Part III offers new experiences for the protagonist as he attempts to navigate this new culture.

1. As you read and review the beginning of Part III, add your observations to the notes about Cultural Criticism that you have been taking for “Tracing a Critical Perspective.”

2. The protagonist meets a woman on the boat who shares her story. Locate the beginning of her narrative. What language indicates the kind of transition Tan uses to signal the flashback?

3. List the main points of the woman’s narrative, using the details in the illustrations as your basis. Write from the woman’s point of view (i.e., “I was reading my book”).

---

**Literary Terms**

A **flashback** is a scene that interrupts the narrative to show events that occurred at an earlier time.
4. The woman’s narrative may become richer if you read it with another critical perspective. With a partner, reread the woman’s story, applying the critical perspective assigned by your teacher. Imagine that you can hear the woman telling her story to the man, like voice-over narration in a film, and draft the voice-over narration in such a way that others should be able to recognize the critical perspective you have applied. As you discuss these readings, use a notetaking guide to capture the ideas. You might use a format you have used already in this unit or try a new one.

Quickwrite: Write a reflection in which you evaluate the two critical perspectives your class has just examined. Which perspective enriches this narrative most for you? Why do you think this is the case?
In Part III, the protagonist continues to experience the culture of the new land.

**Using the Critical Perspectives**

Keep in mind that you are practicing tracing Cultural Criticism through the entire graphic novel, but you can also apply other criticisms to different parts of *The Arrival*. You have discussed feminist and Marxist readings of one of the subplots; now you will apply another criticism. Review Archetypal Critical Perspective and its assumptions. Write a summary of this perspective and its assumptions. You can use the space below.

**Applying Archetypes**

Reread the couple’s narrative, applying the archetypal criticism to the reading. How does this reading enhance your understanding of the couple’s narrative? Explain.

**Analyzing Themes**

You have read the stories of two people that the protagonist encounters, and you may have noticed common themes between the two narratives. On separate paper, create a graphic organizer to help you compare and contrast these two narratives. Use the common assumptions of Cultural Criticism as a guide.

**Considering Titles**

Now that you have finished reading Part III, create an original title that you feel would be appropriate for the content.
In Part IV of *The Arrival*, the protagonist searches for and finds work.

1. The protagonist in *The Arrival*, like all other people, has needs for survival. Brainstorm a list of these needs and mark your list to show which needs the protagonist has managed to meet and what needs he has yet to meet. You can use the space below.

2. On the assembly line, the protagonist meets an elderly man who shares a narrative about going off to war. While you read the old man’s narrative, try to visualize the narrative as a film. What diegetic sounds would appear on the soundtrack? What non-diegetic sounds would you add? Identify where each sound you have described would appear, placing sticky notes at the places in the text you have identified.

3. As you read the old man’s narrative, you may have been thinking in terms of one of the critical perspectives: Reader Response, Cultural, Historical, Archetypal, Feminist, Marxist. Select a critical perspective that makes sense to you and reread the narrative, applying this perspective. Be prepared to share your understanding with others.

4. Now that you have heard how multiple critical perspectives can be applied to this narrative, choose the one that you think best fits and draft an explanation on separate paper.

5. Continue to add to your notes about “Tracing a Critical Perspective” as you finish reading Part IV. After you finish reading, create an original title for this part of *The Arrival*.
Adapting for an Audience

SUGGESTED LEARNING STRATEGIES: Brainstorming, Think-Pair-Share, Sharing and Responding, Close Reading, Role Playing

Reading and Analyzing Part V, The Arrival

1. Before you read Part V, brainstorm a list of reasons that people immigrate to new and sometimes unfamiliar places. Use separate paper.

2. Which, if any, of these reasons seems to apply to the protagonist of The Arrival?

3. After you finish reading it, create a title for Part V, and then consider Tan’s choice to make The Arrival a wordless graphic novel. How would your experience of the book be different if it had words? What is the effect of his choice?

4. The protagonist communicates with people he encounters, despite language obstacles. How has Tan shown the protagonist and the people he encounters changing their delivery based on reaction from their audience?

Writing Prompt: You have examined several text features, or media production elements, of graphic novels during this unit: framing and page composition (Activity 4.4), transition, flow, and establishing shots (Activity 4.5), angles (Activity 4.6), color (Activity 4.7) and now text. How well does Shaun Tan employ these tools of the trade? The protagonist has learned to adapt to survive in his new surroundings. What are some of the ways in which he has adapted? On separate paper, draft an assessment of Tan’s use of these textual features. To support your assessment, be sure to provide examples from what you have read so far of The Arrival.
Preventing for the Group Presentation

5. The Embedded Assessment asks you to participate in a group presentation. An important part of speaking in front of an audience is responding to the audience. Read the following Performance Expectation from the Speaking portion of the College Board Standards for College Success:

- Monitors audience feedback; makes inferences about audience engagement, understanding, and agreement; and adjusts delivery and content to achieve purposes and goals.
- Subsequently reflects on presentation and feedback to determine effectiveness and what changes to make in a future presentation.

Work with your assigned group to make meaning from this standard. What signals can you watch for that can tell you about your audience’s level of engagement, understanding, and agreement? How could a speaker adjust the presentation according to the signal?

6. The standard says that the speaker is supposed to adjust delivery and content. To practice this, choose parts in a role play, using one of the texts on the next two pages:

- **Speaker:** Read a poem aloud.
- **Audience:** Send signals to the speaker. Choose from the list your group generated, and plan when and how you will send the signals. Be consistent so that the speaker can practice adjusting delivery in a meaningful way.
- **Observer:** Take notes about the speaker-audience interaction. Provide feedback on your observations without making judgments.

WORD CONNECTIONS

Complete the analogy.

emigrate : immigrate ::

a. plan : create
b. arrive : stay
c. leave : enter
d. known : unknown
The Led Zeppelin rock band was formed in the late 1960s. The band integrated Delta blues, British folk influences, and modern rock. Their classic recordings include “Whole Lotta Love,” “Ramble On,” and “Stairway to Heaven.”

Ah, ah,
We come from the land of the ice and snow,
From the midnight sun where the hot springs blow.
The hammer of the gods
Will drive our ships to new lands,
To fight the horde, singing and crying:
Valhalla, I am coming!
On we sweep with threshing oar,
Our only goal will be the western shore.
Ah, ah,

We come from the land of the ice and snow,
From the midnight sun where the hot springs blow.
How soft your fields so green,
Can whisper tales of gore,
Of how we calmed the tides of war.
We are your overlords.
On we sweep with threshing oar,
Our only goal will be the western shore.
So now you’d better stop and rebuild all your ruins,
For peace and trust can win the day
Despite of all your losing
Not like the brazen giant of Greek fame,
With conquering limbs astride from land to land;
Here at our sea-washed, sunset gates shall stand
A mighty woman with a torch, whose flame
Is the imprisoned lightning, and her name
Mother of Exiles. From her beacon-hand
Glows world-wide welcome; her mild eyes command
The air-bridged harbor that twice cities frame.
“Keep, ancient lands, your storied pomp” cries she
With silent lips. “Give me your tired, your poor,
Your huddled masses yearning to breathe free,
The wretched refuse of your teeming shore.
Send these, the homeless, tempest-tossed to me:
I lift my lamp beside the golden door!”
Designing a Media Communication

SUGGESTED LEARNING STRATEGIES: Discussion Groups, Notetaking, Sharing and Responding, Drafting

Reading and Analyzing Part VI, *The Arrival*

1. The first page of Part VI nearly parallels the first page of Part I. How are they similar? How are they different? What is the effect of Tan’s choice to make these Parts nearly parallel?

2. After you have finished reading *The Arrival*, consider why Tan might have chosen this title. Choose prewriting strategies, and then draft an analysis of the title on separate paper.

Applying Cultural Criticism

3. The writing and thinking you have done about *The Arrival* should have helped you to gain a deep understanding of this text. Draft a thematic statement or two that is relevant to *The Arrival*.

4. Review the common assumptions of Cultural Criticism and your notes from “Tracing a Critical Perspective.” What are the important issues and ideas in the graphic novel? What issues does a Cultural Critical Perspective highlight?

Creating a Media Presentation

5. You have identified at least one important theme in *The Arrival*. As practice for the Embedded Assessment, you will work with a group to plan and create a media communication to convey one of those important themes. With your group, choose an audience for your media communication, and design a multimedia product that will appeal to that audience. Explore multiple points of view about *The Arrival*, and synthesize information to arrive at a theme or interpretation you will present in your multimedia product. Incorporate sound, graphics, and images that communicate effectively with your chosen audience.
If you had the opportunity, what questions would you like to ask Shaun Tan? Would you want to know how he gets his ideas, how he creates his illustrations, what else he has written? As you read his comments below, you may find the answer to some of those questions.

**Comments on The Arrival**

by Shaun Tan

Much of the difficulty involved combining realistic reference images of people and objects into a wholly imaginary world, as this was always my central concept. In order to best understand what it is like to travel to a new country, I wanted to create a fictional place equally unfamiliar to readers of any age or background (including myself). This of course is where my penchant for 'strange lands' took flight, as I had some early notions of a place where birds are merely ‘bird-like’ and trees ‘tree-like’; where people dress strangely, apartment fixtures are confounding and ordinary street activities are very peculiar. This is what I imagine it must be like for many immigrants, a condition ideally examined through illustration, where every detail can be hand-drawn.

That said, imaginary worlds should never be ‘pure fantasy’, and without a concrete ring of truth, they can easily cripple the reader’s suspended disbelief, or simply confuse them too much. I’m always interested in striking the right balance between everyday objects, animals and people, and their much more fanciful alternatives. In the case of ‘The Arrival’, I drew heavily on my own memories of travelling to foreign countries, that feeling of having basic but imprecise notions of things around me, an awareness of environments saturated with hidden meanings: all very strange yet utterly convincing. In my own nameless country, peculiar creatures emerge from pots and bowls, floating lights drift inquisitively along streets, doors and cupboards conceal their contents, and all around are notices that beckon, invite or warn in loud, indecipherable alphabets. These are all equivalents to some moments I’ve experienced as a traveller, where even simple acts of understanding are challenging.
One of my main sources for visual reference was New York in the early 1900s, a great hub of mass-migration for Europeans. A lot of my ‘inspirational images’ blu-tacked to the walls of my studio were old photographs of immigrant processing at Ellis Island, visual notes that provided underlying concepts, mood and atmosphere behind many scenes that appear in the book. Other images I collected depicted street scenes in European, Asian and Middle-Eastern cities, old-fashioned vehicles, random plants and animals, shopfront signs and posters, apartment interiors, photos of people working, eating, talking and playing, all of them chosen as much for their ordinariness as their possible strangeness. Elements in my drawings evolved gradually from these fairly simple origins. A colossal sculpture in the middle of a city harbour, the first strange sight that greets arriving migrants, suggests some sisterhood with the Statue of Liberty. A scene of immigrants travelling in a cloud of white balloons was inspired by pictures of migrants boarding trains as well as the night-time spawning of coral polyps, two ideas associated by common underlying themes – dispersal and regeneration.

Even the most imaginary phenomena in the book are intended to carry some metaphorical weight, even though they don’t refer to specific things, and may be hard to fully explain. One of the images I had been thinking about for years involved a scene of rotting tenement buildings, over which are ‘swimming’ some kind of huge black serpents. I realised that these could be read a number of ways: literally, as an infestation of monsters, or more figuratively, as some kind of oppressive threat. And even then it is open to the individual reader to decide whether this might be political, economic, personal or something else, depending on what ideas or feelings the picture may inspire.

I am rarely interested in symbolic meanings, where one thing ‘stands for’ something else, because this dissolves the power of fiction to be reinterpreted. I’m more attracted to a kind of intuitive resonance or poetry we can enjoy when looking at pictures, and ‘understanding’ what we see without necessarily being able to articulate it. One key character in my story is a creature that looks something like a walking tadpole, as big as a cat and intent on forming an uninvited friendship with the main protagonist. I have my own impressions as to what this is about, again something to do with learning about acceptance and belonging, but I would have a lot of trouble trying to express this fully in words. It seems to make much more sense as a series of silent pencil drawings.

I am often searching in each image for things that are odd enough to invite a high degree of personal interpretation, and still maintain a ring of truth. The experience of many immigrants actually draws an interesting parallel with the creative and critical way of looking I try to follow as an artist. There is a similar kind of search for meaning, sense and identity in an environment that can be alternately transparent.

---

**WORD CONNECTIONS**

The Latin root of *regenerate* is *gignere*, which means “to beget” or “to produce.” The Latin prefix *re-* means “back” or “again.” Words with the prefix *re-* include *recollect*, *reconcile*, and *record*.
and opaque, sensible and confounding, but always open to re-assessment. I would hope that beyond its immediate subject, any illustrated narrative might encourage its readers to take a moment to look beyond the ‘ordinariness’ of their own circumstances, and consider it from a slightly different perspective. One of the great powers of storytelling is that invites us to walk in other people’s shoes for a while, but perhaps even more importantly, it invites us to contemplate our own shoes also. We might do well to think of ourselves as possible strangers in our own strange land. What conclusions we draw from this are unlikely to be easily summarised, all the more reason to think further on the connections between people and places, and what we might mean when we talk about ‘belonging.’

**Discussion Questions**

1. What personal experiences did Tan draw on to create *The Arrival*?

2. How are Tan’s ideas about imaginary worlds versus pure fantasy realized in *The Arrival*?

3. Although Tan says he is not “interested in symbolic meaning,” what imagery can you point to that seems to function symbolically?

4. How does Tan feel about his readers and their perspective?

**Writing Prompt:** Write a reflective essay in which you compare your perceptions of *The Arrival* to Tan’s explanations of how and why he created it.
In Units 1 through 3, you examined several critical perspectives: Archetypal, Feminist, Marxist, Cultural, Reader Response, and Historical. With your group, complete the following graphic organizer as you analyze the graphic novel using one of the perspectives.

The Critical Perspective: __________________________

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Paraphrase the definition and common assumptions of this criticism.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How does this perspective provide insight into the graphic novel?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How does thinking about this perspective affect your understanding of the characters?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How does thinking about this perspective affect your understanding of the setting?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Which events lend themselves to an interpretation from this critical perspective? Explain.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As you listen to your classmates' presentations of the various perspectives, take notes below. These notes will be helpful as you draft your next paper.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Which critical perspective best illuminates the graphic novel for you?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How does this critical perspective add insight to the graphic novel?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Textual support for your ideas:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As you prepare for the Embedded Assessment, you will need to identify a novel or play and work with your discussion group to develop a reading and discussion plan.

**Organizing the Group:** As you get together with your group, begin your work by identifying the following:
- Group members.
- Title of novel or play.
- Author.
- What you know about this text and/or the author.

**Creating a Reading Schedule:** Work with your discussion group to create a schedule for reading, making sure that your schedule reflects the timeline provided by your teacher. Your schedule should include the following dates:
- Deadline for completing the reading.
- Date of halfway point.
- Dates of other assessment checkpoints.

Make sure that group members write down the reading schedule in their calendars; it is imperative for each member of the group to maintain the reading schedule in order for discussions to be effective.

**Organizing the Reading:** Your group should divide the reading into chunks, by chapters, acts, or even page numbers, and agree on which pages you will discuss at each discussion meeting. In addition, you should set the following goals:
- Reread the Embedded Assessment and web graphic organizer you created to identify the skills and knowledge required (from Activity 4.1).
- Identify what you and your group should be doing while you are reading and discussing the text in order to prepare for the Embedded Assessment.
- Apply multiple critical perspectives to the text.

To support productive discussions, work with your new group to agree upon norms, or standards of conduct, for your group discussions.

On the next page you will find a graphic organizer you may use to take notes during group discussions.
Use an organizer such as this to take notes during your group discussions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Today’s Date:</th>
<th>Reading Assignment:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Summary of Today’s Reading Assignment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Our Purposes for Today’s Discussion</th>
<th>How Purposes Support the Embedded Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>An interesting point made by a member of the discussion group</th>
<th>Support</th>
<th>Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evaluation of Today’s Progress Toward Goals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
With your group, review the critical perspectives and consider how each critical perspective might apply to your novel or play. You can make notes on each perspective in the chart below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reader Response</th>
<th>Cultural</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Archetypal</td>
<td>Marxist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feminist</td>
<td>Historical</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

With your group, follow these steps to continue the process of applying the critical perspectives:

- Decide which critical perspectives seem most appropriate for your play or novel.
- Identify at least four critical perspectives to trace.
- Identify which perspective each group member will focus on.
- Adapt the organizer you used to apply the Cultural Critical Perspective to *The Arrival* for use with the other perspectives you are applying to your novel or play.
Writing a Draft Analysis
At this point in your reading and discussion, you should take some time to focus on your own thoughts and analysis. First, carefully consider the critical perspective you have been applying. Next, draft an explanation of how the critical perspective you are tracing has enriched your understanding of the text so far.

Sharing and Responding
After completing your draft analysis, participate in sharing and responding with your group. Discuss how the other critical perspectives being shared during group discussion meetings have given you new ways to think about the text.

You and your group may notice, too, that the relevance of critical perspectives may shift. For example, a particular critical perspective may shed light on the early part of the text but may lose relevance later in the text.

Planning the Next Stage
Based on your sharing and responding, your group has several options to discuss:

- Continue reading with these critical perspectives.
- Add an additional critical perspective that really seems to fit with those you are already tracing.
- Replace a critical perspective that may not be working with one that might make more sense.
- Identify additional options.

As a group, develop a plan to address these options and present it to your teacher for consideration.

As you continue to meet and discuss the text, keep these options in mind. Adjustments may continue to be beneficial and may enrich your understanding of the text.
Presenting a Literary Work Through Multiple Critical Perspectives

SUGGESTED LEARNING STRATEGIES: Drafting, Discussion Groups, Sketching, Self-Editing/Peer Editing

Assignment

Your assignment is to work with a group to present a novel or play to an audience of your peers. You will collaboratively write an analysis of the literary work from multiple critical perspectives and present your completed analysis in a performance-based or visual medium of your choice. Your analysis should include a summary of the text in the format of a graphic novel.

Planning

1. With your group, choose prewriting strategies to plan a summary of the novel or play. Consider your audience and determine what background knowledge they need to understand your group’s analysis of the work using critical perspectives.

2. Develop a plan for delivering an engaging summary that will not only provide necessary background knowledge, but may also entice your classmates to read the novel or play. Follow Scott McCloud’s example as you use the comic format to deliver the summary, and discuss how you will make your product visible to your audience during the presentation.

3. Collect and review the notes that you took while you read the novel or play, the notes in which you interpreted the work according to a particular critical perspective. Also review the notes you took during group discussions and reflect on how your classmates’ analyses using critical perspectives deepened your understanding of the work. Individually, prepare an analysis of the novel or play enhanced by a critical perspective. As part of your work, identify and analyze nuances and ambiguities within the text and determine how they affect your critical perspective. Also analyze the author’s use of stylistic or rhetorical devices and their aesthetic effect on the reader. Consider how to incorporate representative aesthetic effects in your summary of the text.

4. As a group, agree upon a design for a product in which you synthesize information from multiple points of view. Choose your visual or performance medium. You may use a storyboard with graphics to support your presentation or create a multimedia film or presentation with sound, graphics, and images.

Drafting/Rehearsing

5. Collaboratively draft a summary of the work and then begin planning your frames. Assign roles in the creation of the visual performance medium, and create a schedule for responding and sharing within the group. Remember to give your visual a meaningful title.

6. As individual group members, present to the rest of the group an explanation of how each of you interpreted the book through a critical perspective.
Presenting a Literary Work Through Multiple Critical Perspectives

7. Work together to create the graphic or performance-based representation of multiple critical perspectives that you will present to the class. Each group member must have input so that the representation encompasses all of the critical perspectives discussed by the group.

8. Practice presenting your representation of the work through multiple perspectives, considering it from the point of view of your audience. Make sure that your visual representation or performance presents multiple critical perspectives and that each member plays a part in the presentation of the product.

**TECHNOLOGY TIP** Use available technology to help you create your presentation. If needed, ask for help in learning to use presentation software, video equipment, digital cameras, or graphics programs.

Presenting

9. During your group’s presentation, monitor your audience and adjust your delivery as appropriate.

10. Practice effective speaking skills for your presentation, adapting your spoken language appropriately for formal speaking purposes. Practice active listening as your classmates deliver their presentations.

Evaluating

11. Reflect on your group’s collaboration as well as on the presentation and the response of the audience to determine the effectiveness of the choices made by you and your group.

**TECHNOLOGY TIP** If you have resources available, you may want to scan your work into a slide presentation program that you might then project for your presentation to the class. If you have skills using digital drawing programs, you might also create your graphics with such a program.
### SCORING GUIDE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scoring Criteria</th>
<th>Exemplary</th>
<th>Proficient</th>
<th>Emerging</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Text Summary</strong></td>
<td>The summary in graphic novel format demonstrates an exceptional understanding of the text. It serves as a platform for analysis and skillfully uses genre conventions to deliver an enticing summary to the audience.</td>
<td>The summary in graphic novel format demonstrates a sufficient understanding of the text. It serves as a platform for analysis and logically uses genre conventions to deliver a clear summary to the audience.</td>
<td>The summary in graphic novel format demonstrates an insufficient understanding of the text. It does little to serve as a platform for analysis and/or uses genre conventions ineffectively to deliver an incomplete summary to the audience.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Text Analysis</strong></td>
<td>The visual or performance medium skillfully uses thought-provoking production elements to convey an adept synthesis of multiple critical perspectives.</td>
<td>The visual or performance medium uses interesting production elements to convey a coherent synthesis of multiple critical perspectives.</td>
<td>The visual or performance medium uses minimal production elements and fails to sufficiently convey a logical synthesis of multiple critical perspectives.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Presentation</strong></td>
<td>Participants achieve an informative and engaging presentation while perceptively monitoring the audience to keenly adjust individual delivery if needed.</td>
<td>Participants achieve an interesting presentation while adequately monitoring the audience to accurately adjust individual delivery if needed.</td>
<td>Participants attempt to achieve a clear presentation; monitoring the audience to adjust individual delivery may be attempted but to a limited degree and with limited success.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Additional Criteria**

**Comments:**
Reflection

An important aspect of growing as a learner is to reflect on where you have been, what you have accomplished, what helped you to learn, and how you will apply your new knowledge in the future. Use the following questions to guide your thinking and to identify evidence of your learning.

Thinking about Concepts
1. Using specific examples from this unit, respond to the Essential Questions:
   • How can an examination of text through multiple perspectives affect understanding?
   • How do media production elements shape a message?
2. Consider the academic vocabulary from this unit as well as academic vocabulary from previous units (Archetypal Criticism, Cultural Criticism, Feminist Criticism, Historical Criticism, Marxist Criticism, Reader Response Criticism) and select 3–4 terms of which your understanding has grown. For each term, answer the following questions:
   • What was your understanding of the word prior to the unit?
   • How has your understanding of the word evolved?
   • How will you apply your understanding in the future?

Thinking about Connections
3. Review the activities and products (artifacts) you created. Choose those that most reflect your growth in understanding.
4. For each artifact that you chose, record, respond, and reflect on your thinking and understanding. Use the following questions as a guide:
   a. What skill/knowledge does this artifact reflect, and how did you learn this skill/knowledge?
   b. How did your understanding of the power of language expand through your engagement with this artifact?
   c. How will you apply this skill or knowledge in the future?
5. Create this reflection as Portfolio pages—one for each artifact you choose. For each artifact, identify the concept, describe the artifact, and provide commentary on the questions.

Thinking About Thinking
Portfolio Entry

Concept:

Description of Artifact:

Commentary on Questions: